

Agenda Item 5m

(a) 3/10/1068/FP and (b) 3/10/1069/LB – Two storey side extension with front and rear dormer windows and 1no. roof light at Patient End House, Patient End, Furneux Pelham, Buntingford, Herts, SG9 0JN for Mr and Mrs Callf

Date of Receipt: a) 28.06.2010
b) 14.06.2010

Type: a) Full – Other
b) Listed Building Consent

Parish: FURNEUX PELHAM

Ward: LITTLE HADHAM

RECOMMENDATION

- a) That planning permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:-
1. Three year time limit (1T12)

Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (Hertfordshire County Structure Plan, Minerals Local Plan, Waste Local Plan and the saved policies of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007), and in particular policies GBC3, ENV1, ENV5 and ENV6. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies is that permission should be granted.

- b) That listed building consent be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:-
1. Listed building three year time limit (1T14)
 2. Samples of materials (2E12)
 3. Listed building (new windows) (8L03)
 4. Listed Building (new external rendering) (8L08)
 5. Listed building (making good) (8L10)

Summary of Reasons for Decision

The proposal has been considered with regard to the policies of the Development Plan (Hertfordshire County Structure Plan, Minerals Local Plan, Waste Local Plan and the saved policies of the East Herts Local Plan Second Review April 2007), and in particular Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning for the Historic Environment. The balance of the considerations having regard to those policies is that consent should be granted.

1.0 Background

- 1.1 The application site is located within the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt as shown on the attached OS extract.
- 1.2 The application property is a two storey detached dwelling which is a Grade II Listed Building. The property benefits from off-street parking and a detached garage which could accommodate between 2 and 3 vehicles. The property is situated within a large site which is predominantly laid-to-lawn and screened by mature trees at the front of the site.
- 1.3 The proposal is for a two storey side extension with front and rear dormer windows and 1no. roof light. The proposed side extension would be set below the roof ridge of the main dwelling and would project 4.7 metres from the side of the property. There would be a single dormer window inserted into the front and rear roof slope of the proposed extension and 1no. roof light would be inserted into the rear roof slope of the existing dwelling. The proposed extensions would provide a living room at ground floor level and an extra bedroom and ensuite bathroom at first floor level.

2.0 Site History

- 2.1 Planning permission and listed building consent was previously approved for alterations and extensions to the dwelling (LPA Ref: 3/95/0441/FP, 3/95/0442/LB). A subsequent application for a new double garage was later granted planning permission (LPA Ref: 3/96/0857/FP). There is no other relevant planning history at the application site.

3.0 Consultation Responses

- 3.1 The Council's Conservation Officer commented that Patient End House is a two storey dwelling with attics, C19th farmhouse of brick construction and a plain clay tile roof. The square plan form of the main range has been subject to a modern rear extension, projecting from the same axis as the central chimney of the principle building, constructed in similar materials.
- 3.2 In assessing the historic and architectural significance of the listed building and the proposed works which are limited to a conservation rooflight located on the rear of the principal slope and the adaptation of two gable end windows to accommodate access to the proposed side extension. The proposal in this instance is considered to have limited impact on the historic and architectural significance of the building. Recommend approval subject

a) 3/10/1068/FP and b) 3/10/1069/LB

to a new windows and making good condition.

4.0 Parish Council Representations

4.1 No comments from Furneux Pelham Parish Council had been received at the time of writing this report.

5.0 Other Representations

5.1 The applications have been advertised by way of press notice, site notice and neighbour notification.

5.2 No letters of representation have been received.

6.0 Policy

6.1 The relevant Local Plan policies in these applications include the following:-

GBC3	Appropriate Development in the Rural Area Beyond the Green Belt
ENV1	Design and Environmental Quality
ENV5	Extensions to Dwellings
ENV6	Extensions to Dwellings – Criteria

In addition to the above it is considered that Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning for the Historic Environment forms a material consideration in the determination of these applications.

7.0 Considerations

- 7.1 The determining issues in relation to these applications are as follows:
- The principle of development within the Rural Area;
 - The impact of the proposal on the character and appearance of the existing listed dwelling and its setting;
 - The impact on the amenities of neighbouring residential occupiers.

Principle of Development

7.1 The application site is located within the Rural Area, wherein limited extensions and alterations to dwellings will be permitted provided that an extension to a dwelling or the erection of outbuilding will be of a scale and size that would either by itself, or cumulatively with other extensions, not disproportionately alter the size of the original dwelling nor intrude into the openness or rural qualities of the surrounding area, in accordance with Policies GBC1 and ENV5.

a) 3/10/1068/FP and b) 3/10/1069/LB

- 7.2 It has been calculated that the floor area of the original dwelling was approximately 112.8 square metres (sq.m). However, the previously approved extensions and double garage resulted in an increase of some 69.5 sq.m, which represents a 61 per cent increase in the size of the original dwelling. It is considered that the proposed two storey side extension would cumulatively, with other extensions to the dwelling, result in an increase of some 91 per cent in the size of the original dwelling, which would form a departure from Policies GBC3 and ENV5 the Local Plan. It is therefore necessary to consider whether in this case special circumstances exist that clearly outweigh the harm by reason of inappropriateness or any other harm to the Rural Area.
- 7.3 Patient End House is a modest two storey dwelling which benefits from a large site which is well screened from its surroundings by mature trees at the front. It is considered that the proposed extension would be set below the roof ridge of the main dwelling and would be sympathetic to the simple character and appearance of the listed dwelling. The applicant has indicated that they have a young growing family and therefore require more habitable accommodation. The proposed extensions would increase the number of existing bedrooms from 2 to 3 and would provide an additional reception room at ground floor level. Furthermore, it is considered that the proposed extension would not in itself disproportionately alter the size and scale of the original dwelling and the provision of additional habitable accommodation would secure the long term viable use of this listed dwelling. It is therefore considered that the long term retention of the listed building, the need for additional accommodation and the limited impact of the proposed extension on the character and appearance of the Rural Area would constitute special circumstances that would outweigh the harm by reason of inappropriateness in the Rural Area.

The impact of the proposal on the character and appearance of the existing listed dwelling and its setting

- 7.4 It is considered that the lower roof ridge and limited depth of the proposed two storey side extension would be subordinate to the listed dwelling. Furthermore, it is considered that the proposed dormer windows would be modest in size and situated comfortably within the roof slope, in line with the existing dormer windows within the roof slope of the main dwelling and in keeping with the traditional character and appearance of the listed building. It is considered that existing internal access would be modified to enable access into the proposed extension, therefore minimising the impact of the development on the historic fabric of the listed building. The site is well screened from the surrounding area and the resultant building's low key visual appearance would not be detrimental to the character and appearance of the existing listed dwelling, or the openness and rural

a) 3/10/1068/FP and b) 3/10/1069/LB

character of the surrounding area.

- 7.5 With regards to the impact of the proposal on the setting of the listed building, the Council's Conservation Officer has raised no objections to the proposal. Taking the above considerations into account, it is considered that the proposed two storey extension would not be detrimental to the setting of the listed building, in accordance with Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning for the Historic Environment.

The impact on the amenities of neighbouring residential occupiers

- 7.6 Patient End House and the adjacent property to the West known as Gables Cottage are surrounded by open countryside. It is considered that the proposed extension, which would be situated on the Eastern (side) elevation of the dwelling and shielded by existing extensions, would not be detrimental to the amenities of adjacent neighbouring occupiers. Patient End House is situated over 120 metres away from its next nearest neighbour, the property known as Little Mead to the West. Therefore it is considered that the proposed extension would not be detrimental to the amenities of other nearby residential occupiers.

8.0 Conclusion

- 8.1 In summary, it is considered that the proposed development would be acceptable in this instance and that special circumstances exist to outweigh the harm, by reason of inappropriateness within the Rural Area.
- 8.2 It is therefore considered that there are circumstances in this case to allow permission to be granted contrary to Policy GBC3 and ENV5 of the East Herts Local Plan, and it is recommended that permission be granted subject to the conditions set out above.

This page is intentionally left blank